## Kybernetika

## Andrea Stupňanová; Anna Kolesárová

Associative $n$-dimensional copulas

Kybernetika, Vol. 47 (2011), No. 1, 93-99
Persistent URL: http://dml.cz/dmlcz/141480

## Terms of use:

© Institute of Information Theory and Automation AS CR, 2011

Institute of Mathematics of the Academy of Sciences of the Czech Republic provides access to digitized documents strictly for personal use. Each copy of any part of this document must contain these Terms of use.


This paper has been digitized, optimized for electronic delivery and stamped with digital signature within the project DML-CZ: The Czech Digital Mathematics Library http://project.dml.cz

# ASSOCIATIVE $n$-DIMENSIONAL COPULAS 

Andrea Stupňanová and Anna Kolesárová

The associativity of $n$-dimensional copulas in the sense of Post is studied. These copulas are shown to be just $n$-ary extensions of associative 2 -dimensional copulas with special constraints, thus they solve an open problem of R. Mesiar posed during the International Conference FSTA 2010 in Liptovský Ján, Slovakia.

Keywords: Archimedean copula, associativity in the sense of Post, $n$-dimensional copula Classification: 03E72

## 1. INTRODUCTION

Copulas were introduced by Sklar [13] to capture the stochastic dependence structure of random variables. Recall that for $n \geq 2$, a function $C:[0,1]^{n} \rightarrow[0,1]$ is called an $n$-dimensional copula ( $n$-copula, for short) whenever it is a restriction of an $n$ dimensional distribution function with all univariate margins uniformly distributed on $[0,1]$. Hence an $n$-copula is characterized by the properties:
(C1) $C\left(x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right)=x_{i}$ whenever $\forall j \neq i, x_{j}=1$;
(C2) $C\left(x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right)=0$ whenever $0 \in\left\{x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right\}$;
(C3) the $n$-increasing property, i. e., $\forall \mathbf{x}, \mathbf{y} \in[0,1]^{n}, x_{i} \leq y_{i}, i=1, \ldots, n$, it holds

$$
\sum_{J \subset\{1, \ldots, n\}}(-1)^{|J|} C\left(u_{1}^{J}, \ldots, u_{n}^{J}\right) \geq 0, \text { where } u_{i}^{J}= \begin{cases}x_{i}, & \text { if } i \in J,  \tag{1}\\ y_{i}, & \text { if } i \notin J .\end{cases}
$$

By the Sklar theorem [13, for any $n$-dimensional random vector $Z=\left(X_{1}, \ldots, X_{n}\right)$ there is an $n$-copula $C:[0,1]^{n} \rightarrow[0,1]$ such that for each $\left(z_{1}, \ldots, z_{n}\right) \in \mathbb{R}^{n}$

$$
F_{Z}\left(z_{1}, \ldots, z_{n}\right)=C\left(F_{X_{1}}\left(z_{1}\right), \ldots, F_{X_{n}}\left(z_{n}\right)\right),
$$

where $F_{Z}, F_{X_{1}}, \ldots, F_{X_{n}}$ are distribution functions of the corresponding random vectors.

There are two distinguished functions which are $n$-copulas for each $n \geq 2$ : the so-called minimum $n$-copula $M$ and the product $n$-copula $\Pi$, given by

$$
\begin{aligned}
M\left(x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right) & =\min \left\{x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right\} \\
\Pi\left(x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right) & =\prod_{i=1}^{n} x_{i} .
\end{aligned}
$$

The minimum $n$-copula $M$ describes the comonotone dependence of random variables $X_{1}, \ldots, X_{n}$ and the product $n$-copula $\Pi$ describes their independence. For more details we recommend monographs [4, 11].
For each $n$-copula $C$ it holds

$$
W \leq C \leq M
$$

where $W$ is the so-called Fréchet-Hoeffding lower bound, given by

$$
W\left(x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right)=\max \left\{0, \sum_{i=1}^{n} x_{i}-(n-1)\right\} .
$$

It is a well-known fact that this function is a copula only for $n=2$, and in that case describes the countermonotone dependence of random variables $X_{1}$ and $X_{2}$.

All the three basic 2-copulas (copulas, for short) $M, \Pi$ and $W$ are associative, i. e., for all $x_{1}, x_{2}, x_{3} \in[0,1]$ they satisfy the property

$$
\begin{equation*}
C\left(C\left(x_{1}, x_{2}\right), x_{3}\right)=C\left(x_{1}, C\left(x_{2}, x_{3}\right)\right) . \tag{2}
\end{equation*}
$$

Associativity as an algebraic property was originally introduced for binary functions only, see formula (21). Recently, based on ideas of Post 12, Couceiro [1 has studied the associativity of $n$-ary functions. Subsequently, during the open problem session at FSTA 2010, R. Mesiar has posed the problem of representation of associative $n$-copulas, see [8]. Recall that for $n=2$ this problem was solved in seventies by Ling [6] and Moynihan [10].

The aim of this paper is to solve the above mentioned open problem for any fixed $n>2$. The paper is organized as follows. In the next section, the representation of associative copulas is recalled. In Section 3 we study $n$-ary associative functions on $[0,1]$ possessing a neutral element and we show their relationship with binary associative functions. In Section 4, we introduce a representation theorem for associative $n$-copulas, together with some examples. Finally, some concluding remarks are added.

## 2. ASSOCIATIVE 2-DIMENSIONAL COPULAS

As mentioned above, 2-dimensional copulas will be referred to as copulas only. Let $C:[0,1]^{2} \rightarrow[0,1]$ be an associative copula satisfying $C(x, x)<x$ for all $\left.x \in\right] 0,1[$. Then $C$ is called an Archimedean copula. Moynihan [10] has proved the next representation theorem for Archimedean copulas.

Theorem 2.1. A function $C:[0,1]^{2} \rightarrow[0,1]$ is an Archimedean copula if and only if there is a continuous strictly decreasing convex function $f:[0,1] \rightarrow[0, \infty], f(1)=0$, such that

$$
\begin{equation*}
C\left(x_{1}, x_{2}\right)=f^{(-1)}\left(f\left(x_{1}\right)+f\left(x_{2}\right)\right) \tag{3}
\end{equation*}
$$

where $f^{(-1)}$ is the pseudo-inverse of $f$.
Recall that the pseudo-inverse $f^{(-1)}:[0, \infty] \rightarrow[0,1]$ is given by

$$
f^{(-1)}(u)=f^{-1}(\min (f(0), u)) .
$$

The function $f$ in the above theorem is called a generator of an Archimedean copula $C$. It is unique up to a positive multiplicative constant.

Copulas $W$ and $\Pi$ are Archimedean, with generators $f_{\mathrm{W}}$ and $f_{\Pi}$, respectively, given by $f_{\mathrm{W}}(x)=1-x$ and $f_{\Pi}(x)=-\log x$. If we define the function $f_{(1)}:[0,1] \rightarrow$ $[0, \infty]$ by $f_{(1)}(x)=\frac{1}{x}-1$, it is also a generator and the corresponding Archimedean copula $C_{(1)}:[0,1]^{2} \rightarrow[0,1]$ is given by

$$
C_{(1)}\left(x_{1}, x_{2}\right)=\frac{x_{1} x_{2}}{x_{1}+x_{2}-x_{1} x_{2}}
$$

whenever $\left(x_{1}, x_{2}\right) \neq(0,0)$.
For a general associative copula $C$ we have the next representation theorem (4) (11).
Theorem 2.2. A function $C:[0,1]^{2} \rightarrow[0,1]$ is an associative copula if and only if there is a system (]$a_{k}, b_{k}[)_{k \in \mathcal{K}}$ of pairwise disjoint open subintervals of $[0,1]$ and a system $\left(C_{k}\right)_{k \in \mathcal{K}}$ of Archimedean copulas such that

$$
C\left(x_{1}, x_{2}\right)= \begin{cases}a_{k}+\left(b_{k}-a_{k}\right) C_{k}\left(\frac{x_{1}-a_{k}}{b_{k}-a_{k}}, \frac{x_{2}-a_{k}}{b_{k}-a_{k}}\right), & \text { if } \left.\left(x_{1}, x_{2}\right) \in\right] a_{k}, b_{k}\left[^{2}\right.  \tag{4}\\ M\left(x_{1}, x_{2}\right), & \text { for some } k \in \mathcal{K}\end{cases}
$$

Observe that if $\mathcal{K}=\emptyset$ then $C$ in (4) is the strongest copula $M$. Archimedean copulas are linked to $\mathcal{K}=\{1\}$ and $] a_{1}, b_{1}[=] 0,1[$. Copula $C$ given by (4) is called an ordinal sum copula, with notation $\left(\left\langle a_{k}, b_{k}, C_{k}\right\rangle \mid k \in \mathcal{K}\right)$.
Example 2.3. Let $C=\left(\left\langle 0, \frac{1}{2}, \Pi\right\rangle\right)$. Then

$$
C\left(x_{1}, x_{2}\right)= \begin{cases}2 x_{1} x_{2}, & \text { if } \left.\left(x_{1}, x_{2}\right) \in\right] 0, \frac{1}{2}\left[^{2}\right. \\ M\left(x_{1}, x_{2}\right), & \text { else }\end{cases}
$$

## 3. N-ARY ASSOCIATIVE FUNCTIONS WITH NEUTRAL ELEMENT

The associativity of $n$-ary functions was introduced by Post 12.
Definition 3.1. Let $n \geq 2$ and $I$ be a real interval. A function $F: I^{n} \rightarrow I$ is said to be associative whenever for all $x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}, \ldots, x_{2 n-1} \in I$ it holds

$$
\begin{align*}
& F\left(F\left(x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right), x_{n+1}, \ldots, x_{2 n-1}\right)=F\left(x_{1}, F\left(x_{2}, \ldots, x_{n+1}\right), x_{n+2}, \ldots, x_{2 n-1}\right) \\
= & \cdots=F\left(x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n-1}, F\left(x_{n}, \ldots, x_{2 n-1}\right)\right) . \tag{5}
\end{align*}
$$

Evidently, for $n=2$, formulas (5) and (2) coincide, i. e., the Post $n$-ary associativity is a concept extending the standard notion of associativity for binary functions (operations). In the next definition, we recall the notion of neutral element, see [3].
Definition 3.2. Let $n \geq 2$ and $I$ be a real interval. A function $F: I^{n} \rightarrow I$ is said to have neutral element $e \in I$ whenever $F\left(x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right)=x_{i}$ if $x_{j}=e$ for each $j \neq i$.
Evidently, property (C1) of $n$-copulas means that $n$-copulas have neutral element $e=1$. We say that a function $F$ is an $n$-ary extension of a binary function $G$ if it holds

$$
\left.F\left(x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right)=G\left(G\left(\ldots G\left(G\left(x_{1}, x_{2}\right), x_{3}\right) \ldots\right), x_{n-1}\right), x_{n}\right)
$$

for all $n$-tuples in $I^{n}$.

## Example 3.3.

(i) Define a mapping $F: \mathbb{R}^{3} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ by $F\left(x_{1}, x_{2}, x_{3}\right)=x_{1}-x_{2}+x_{3}$. Then $F$ is a ternary associative function. Observe that there is no binary associative function whose ternary extension coincides with $F$. Moreover, $F$ has no neutral element.
(ii) Let $C:[0,1]^{3} \rightarrow[0,1]$ be given by $C\left(x_{1}, x_{2}, x_{3}\right)=x_{1} \min \left\{x_{2}, x_{3}\right\}$. Then $e=1$ is neutral element of $C$, but $C$ is not associative. Note that $C$ is a ternary copula.

Theorem 3.4. Consider $n \geq 2$. Let $I$ be a real interval and $e \in I$. Then the following claims are equivalent:
(i) A mapping $F: I^{n} \rightarrow I$ is associative function with neutral element $e$.
(ii) There is a binary associative function $G: I^{2} \rightarrow I$ with neutral element $e$ whose $n$-ary extension is $F$.

Proof. If $n=2$, the claim is trivial. Suppose that $n>2$.

- (i) $\Leftarrow$ (ii) The proof is trivial.
- (i) $\Rightarrow$ (ii) Define a function $G: I^{2} \rightarrow I$ by $G\left(x_{1}, x_{2}\right)=F\left(x_{1}, x_{2}, e, \ldots, e\right)$. Then $G\left(x_{1}, e\right)=F\left(x_{1}, e, \ldots, e\right)=x_{1}$ and $G\left(e, x_{2}\right)=F\left(e, x_{2}, e, \ldots, e\right)=x_{2}$, i. e., $e$ is a neutral element of $G$. Moreover, for any $x_{1}, x_{2}, x_{3} \in I$ it holds

$$
\begin{gathered}
G\left(G\left(x_{1}, x_{2}\right), x_{3}\right)=F\left(F\left(x_{1}, x_{2}, e, \ldots, e\right), x_{3}, e, \ldots, e\right) \\
=F(x_{1}, x_{2}, F(\underbrace{e, \ldots, e,}_{(n-2) \text {-times }} x_{3}, e), \underbrace{e, \ldots, e}_{(n-3) \text {-times }})=F(x_{1}, x_{2}, x_{3}, \underbrace{e, \ldots, e}_{(n-3) \text {-times }}),
\end{gathered}
$$

and

$$
\begin{gathered}
G\left(x_{1}, G\left(x_{2}, x_{3}\right)\right)=F\left(x_{1}, F\left(x_{2}, x_{3}, e, \ldots, e\right), e, \ldots, e\right) \\
=F(x_{1}, x_{2}, F(x_{3}, \underbrace{e, \ldots, e}_{(n-1) \text {-times }}), \underbrace{e, \ldots, e}_{(n-3) \text {-times }})=F(x_{1}, x_{2}, x_{3}, \underbrace{e, \ldots, e}_{(n-3) \text {-times }}),
\end{gathered}
$$

which proves the associativity of $G$. From this proof it is also obvious that if $n=3$, then $F\left(x_{1}, x_{2}, x_{3}\right)=G\left(G\left(x_{1}, x_{2}\right), x_{3}\right)$. For $n>3, G\left(G\left(x_{1}, x_{2}\right), x_{3}\right)=$
$=F(x_{1}, x_{2}, x_{3}, \underbrace{e, \ldots, e}_{(n-3) \text {-times }})$ and similarly we can show that

$$
G\left(G\left(G\left(x_{1}, x_{2}\right), x_{3}\right), x_{4}\right)=F(x_{1}, x_{2}, x_{3}, x_{4}, \underbrace{e, \ldots, e}_{(n-4) \text {-times }}) .
$$

By induction on $n$ it can be proved that for any $n>2$,

$$
G\left(G\left(\ldots G\left(G\left(x_{1}, x_{2}\right), \ldots\right), x_{n-1}\right), x_{n}\right)=F\left(x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right) .
$$

Theorem 3.4 shows that under the neutral element existence, the associativity of $n$-ary functions is classically related to the associativity of binary functions.

## 4. ON THE STRUCTURE OF ASSOCIATIVE N-DIMENSIONAL COPULAS

Based on Theorems 2.1 2.23 .4 and recent results on ordinal sum structure of $n$-copulas proved by Mesiar and Sempi 9, we have the next result.

Corollary 4.1. Let $n \geq 2$. A function $C:[0,1]^{n} \rightarrow[0,1]$ is an associative $n$-copula if and only if there is a system (]$a_{k}, b_{k}[)_{k \in \mathcal{K}}$ of pairwise disjoint open subintervals of ] 0,1 [, and a system $\left(C_{k}\right)_{k \in \mathcal{K}}$ of associative $n$-copulas satisfying the diagonal inequality $C_{k}(x, \ldots, x)<x$ for all $\left.x \in\right] 0,1[$ and $k \in \mathcal{K}$ such that

$$
C\left(x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right)=\left\{\begin{array}{cc}
a_{k}+\left(b_{k}-a_{k}\right) \mathrm{C}_{k}\left(\frac{\min \left\{x_{1}, b_{k}\right\}-a_{k}}{b_{k}-a_{k}}, \ldots, \frac{\min \left\{x_{n}, b_{k}\right\}-a_{k}}{b_{k}-a_{k}}\right)  \tag{6}\\
\left.\quad \text { if } \min \left\{x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right\} \in\right] a_{k}, b_{k}[ & \text { for some } k \in \mathcal{K} \\
M\left(x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right) & \text { else }
\end{array}\right.
$$

To complete the representation of associative $n$-copulas, the characterization of such copulas satisfying the diagonal inequality is necessary.

Theorem 4.2. Let $n \geq 2$. A function $C:[0,1]^{n} \rightarrow[0,1]$ is an associative $n$-copula satisfying the diagonal inequality $C(x, \ldots, x)<x$ for all $x \in] 0,1$ [ if and only if there is a generator $f$ whose pseudo-inverse $f^{(-1)}$ is an $(n-2)$-times differentiable function with derivatives alternating the sign, such that $(-1)^{n} \frac{\mathbf{d}^{n-2} f^{(-1)}}{\mathbf{d} x^{n-2}}$ is a convex function, and

$$
\begin{equation*}
C\left(x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right)=f^{(-1)}\left(\sum_{i=1}^{n} f\left(x_{i}\right)\right) \tag{7}
\end{equation*}
$$

Proof. The sufficiency of conditions follows from [7.
By Theoren $3.4 C$ is an $n$-ary extension of an associative copula $G$. Suppose that $G\left(x_{0}, x_{0}\right)=x_{0}$ for some $\left.x_{0} \in\right] 0,1[$. Then

$$
C\left(x_{0}, \ldots, x_{0}\right)=G\left(G\left(\ldots G\left(G\left(x_{0}, x_{0}\right), \ldots\right), x_{0}\right), x_{0}\right)=x_{0}
$$

which violates the diagonal inequality satisfied by $C$. Therefore $G$ also satisfies the diagonal inequality, i. e., $G(x, x)<x$ for all $x \in] 0,1$ [. By Theorem 1, formula (77) is satisfied for some generator $f$. Moreover, $C$ given by (7) is $n$-increasing and hence, according to the results of McNeil and Nešlehová in [7], the required properties of $f$ are necessary.

## Example 4.3.

(i) As already mentioned, the product $n$-copula $\Pi$ is associative for any $n \geq 2$. Evidently, $\Pi(x, \ldots, x)=x^{n}<x$ whenever $\left.x \in\right] 0,1\left[\right.$. As the generator $f_{\Pi}$ of the copula $\Pi$ is given by $f_{\Pi}(x)=-\log x$, it holds $f_{\Pi}^{(-1)}(x)=f_{\Pi}^{-1}(x)=e^{-x}$, hence for any $k, \frac{\mathbf{d}^{k} f_{\Pi}^{-1}(x)}{\mathbf{d} x^{k}}=(-1)^{k} e^{-x}$. Derivatives alternate the sign and for any $n \geq 2,(-1)^{n} \frac{\mathbf{d}^{n-2} f_{\Pi}^{(-1)}(x)}{\mathbf{d} x^{n-2}}=e^{-x}$ is a convex function.
(ii) A similar result can be shown for the generator $f_{(1)}$ introduced in Section 2, given by $f_{(1)}(x)=\frac{1}{x}-1$. It holds $f_{(1)}^{(-1)}(x)=f_{(1)}^{-1}(x)=(1+x),{ }^{-1}$ which implies that
$(-1)^{n} \frac{\mathbf{d}^{n-2} f_{\Pi}^{(-1)}(x)}{\mathbf{d} x^{n-2}}=(n-2)!(1+x)^{-n+1}$ is convex. The corresponding $n$ copula $C_{(1)}$ is given by $C_{(1)}(x)=\left(\sum_{i=1}^{n} \frac{1}{x_{i}}-(n-1)\right)^{-1}$.
(iii) The weakest associative $n$-copula is the Clayton copula $C_{\left(-\frac{1}{n-1}\right)}$ generated by the generator $f_{\left(-\frac{1}{n-1}\right)}:[0,1] \rightarrow[0, \infty], f_{\left(-\frac{1}{n-1}\right)}=1-x^{\frac{1}{n-1}}$. The corresponding pseudo-inverse $f_{\left(-\frac{1}{n-1}\right)}^{(-1)}:[0, \infty] \rightarrow[0,1]$ is given by

$$
f_{\left(-\frac{1}{n-1}\right)}^{(-1)}(x)=\left\{\begin{array}{cl}
(1-x)^{n-1}, & \text { if } x \leq 1 \\
0, & \text { if } x>1
\end{array}\right.
$$

Then $(-1)^{n} \frac{\mathbf{d}^{n-2} f_{\left(-\frac{1}{n-1}\right)}^{(-1)}(x)}{\mathbf{d} x^{n-2}}=(n-1)!\max \{1-x, 0\}$ is convex but not differentiable. For more details we recommend [7].
(iv) The function $C:[0,1]^{n} \rightarrow[0,1]$ given by

$$
\mathrm{C}\left(x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right)=\left\{\begin{array}{cl}
2^{n-1} \prod_{i=1}^{n} \min \left\{x_{i}, \frac{1}{2}\right\}, & \text { if } \min \left\{x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right\}<\frac{1}{2}  \tag{8}\\
M\left(x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right), & \text { else }
\end{array}\right.
$$

is an $n$-ary extension of the ordinal sum copula ( $\left\langle 0, \frac{1}{2}, \Pi\right\rangle$ ) introduced in Example 2.3 As $n$-ary function $\Pi$ is an associative $n$-copula for each $n \geq 2$, our function $C$ given by (8) is also an associative $n$-copula for each $n \geq 2$.

## 5. CONCLUDING REMARKS

We have solved the Problem 2.1 posed in [8], showing that associative $n$-copulas are just $n$-ary extensions of appropriate associative copulas. Based on Theorem 3.4, similar results can be formulated for the representation of continuous $n$-ary triangular norms or triangular conorms [5], and also for $n$-ary uninorms [2] continuous up to the case when $\{0,1\} \subseteq\left\{x_{1}, \ldots, x_{n}\right\}$.

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

The support of grants VEGA $1 / 0373 / 08$, VEGA $1 / 0198 / 09$ and APVV-0012-07 is kindly acknowledged.
(Received October 20, 2010)

## REFERENCES

[1] M. Couceiro: On two generalizations of associativity. In: Abstracts of FSTA 2010 (E. P. Klement et. al., eds.), Liptovský Ján 2010, p. 47.
[2] J. Fodor, R. Yager, and A. Rybalov: Structure of uninorms. Internat. J. Uncertainty, Fuzziness Knowledge-Based Systems 5 (1997), 411-427.
[3] M. Grabisch, J.-L. Marichal, R. Mesiar, and E. Pap: Aggregation Functions. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge 2009.
[4] H. Joe: Multivariable Models and Dependence Concepts. Chapman \& Hall, London 1997.
[5] E.-P. Klement, R. Mesiar, and E. Pap: Triangular Norms. Kluwer Academic Publishers, Dortrecht 2000.
[6] C. H. Ling: Representation of associative functions. Publicationes Mathematicae Debrecen 12 (1965), 189-212.
[7] A.-J. McNeil and J. Nešlehová: Multivariate Archimedean copulas, d-monotone functions and $L_{1}$-norm symmetric distributions. Annals Statist. 37 (2009), 30593097.
[8] R. Mesiar and P. Sarkoci: Open problems posed at the 10th International Conference on Fuzzy Set Theory and Appl. (FSTA 2010), Liptovský Ján. Kybernetika 46 (2010), 585-598.
[9] R. Mesiar and C. Sempi: Ordinal sums and idempotents of copulas. Aequationes Math. 79 (2010), 1-2, 39-52.
[10] R. Moynihan: Infinite $\tau_{T}$ products of distribution functions. J. Austral. Math. Soc. Ser. A 26 (1978), 227-240.
[11] R.-B. Nelsen: An Introduction to Copulas. Second edition. Springer Science and Business Media, New York 2006.
[12] E.-L. Post: Polyadic groups. Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. 48 (1940), 208-350.
[13] A. Sklar: Fonctions de répartition à $n$ dimensions et leurs marges. Publ. Inst. Statist. Univ. Paris 8 (1959), 229-231.

Andrea Stupňanová, Department of Mathematics, Slovak University of Technology, Radlinského 11, 81368 Bratislava. Slovak Republic.
e-mail: stupnanova@stuba.sk
Anna Kolesárová, Institute IAM, Faculty of Chemical and Food Technology, Slovak University of Technology, 81237 Bratislava. Slovak Republic.
e-mail: anna.kolesarova@stuba.sk

